

REMARKS

In the Office Action issued on November 9, 2009, claims 1-9 and 17 were rejected under 35 U.S.C. §103 as being unpatentable over Varon in view of U.S. Patent No. 6,408,404 to Ladwig. Claims 10-14 and 18 were rejected under 35 U.S.C. § 103 as being unpatentable over Ladwig in view of Varon. The Examiner also rejected claims 1-14 17, and 18 under 35 U.S.C. §112, first paragraph.

Claims 1 – 14, 17 and 18 are now pending in this application. Claims 1, 9 and 10 were amended. No new matter has been added.

Rejection under 35 U.S.C. §112, first paragraph

The Examiner rejected claims 1-14 17, and 18 under 35 U.S.C. §112, first paragraph. The Applicant has amended the language to clearly reflect the subject matter related to receiving a communication that is either an OPLAN or a situation report as disclosed on pages 10 through 11 of the written description. Accordingly, the object is believed to be overcome and withdrawal of the rejection is respectfully requested.

Rejection under 35 U.S.C. §103

The Examiner rejected claims 1-9 and 17 under 35 U.S.C. §103 as being unpatentable over U.S. Patent No. 6,420,993 to Varon. Varon discloses a technique for predicting conflict between maneuvering and non-maneuvering aircrafts. The system

receives input including flight data plans designating a route and target signal corresponding to a signal transmitted from, or reflected off of, an aircraft. The system updates and maintains target signals to monitor the locations and speed of aircrafts and generates alerts to indicate that one or more targets are physically closer than allowed using the information received. The system uses the input flight data plans to "designate routes" or "compute a composite flight path" for the aircrafts and predicts violations of separation standards based on a comparison of the "designated routes" or "composite flight path." See Varon col. 4, lines 23-30 and col. 5, lines 19-31.

In contrast, the present invention predict whether an alert should be issued because of conflicting natural language instructions. As now claims by claim 1, the present invention "an input module for determining that the first natural language message is of a first report type, cycling through the first natural language message to obtain a first plurality of messages from the first natural language message, and providing the location of each of the first plurality of messages within the first natural language message and the relationship of each of the first plurality of messages and the first natural language message" and "determining if execution of the first natural language message complies

with the intent of a user issuing the first natural language message prior to the execution of the first natural language message based in part, on a comparison of the first plurality of messages obtained from the first natural language message and the second natural language message and a comparison of the first plurality of messages and reference information in a database." Support for these amendments can be found at pages 10 through 11 of the specification. Varon fails to disclose that any messages are obtained from a flight plan or that there are different kinds of target data signals. In addition, Varon fails to disclose that the location of each of the first plurality of messages within the first natural language message and the relationship of each of the first plurality of messages and the first natural language message are provided. There is also no disclosure in Varon of comparing any portion of the data flight plans for the respective aircrafts and reference data in a database. There is only disclosure that "a composite flight plan is computed and that violations of separation standards are predicted." See Varon col. 5, lines 19-31. Varon fails to teach or suggest the above-identified limitations. Accordingly, claim 1 of the present invention is not unpatentable over Varon.

Claims 2-9 and 17 depend from claim 1 and thus are not unpatentable over Varon for at least the reasons discussed with respect to claim 1.

The Applicant respectfully submits that the present invention according to 9 is not unpatentable over Varon in view of Ladwig. Ladwig does not cure the deficiencies of Varon. Ladwig merely discloses that an event stream can be transformed. There is no disclosure of how the stream is transformed no the information included in a transformed event stream. There is also no disclosure of performing any kind of combination of transformed event streams. The combination of Varon and Ladwig fails

to teach or suggest the above-identified limitations of claim 1 as well as the identified limitations in claim 9. Accordingly, claim 9 of the present invention is not unpatentable over Varon in view of Ladwig.

The Applicant respectfully submits that the present invention according to 10-14 and 18 are not unpatentable over Ladwig in view Varon for the same reasons discussed above with respect to claims 1 and 9 above.

Each of the claims now pending in this application is believed to be in form for allowance. Accordingly, favorable reconsideration of this case and early issuance of the Notice of Allowance is respectfully requested.

A Petition for Extension of Time is submitted herewith extending the time for response two months to and including April 9, 2010. The Commissioner is hereby authorized to charge any insufficient fees or credit any overpayment associated with this application to Deposit Account No. 50-4545 (5219-009-US01)

Conclusion

In view of the foregoing, all of the Examiner's rejections to the claims are believed to be overcome. The Applicants respectfully request reconsideration and issuance of a Notice of Allowance for all the claims remaining in the application. Should the Examiner feel further communication would facilitate prosecution, he is urged to call the undersigned at the phone number provided below.

Respectfully Submitted,

/Chadwick A. Jackson, Registration No.

46,495/

Date: April 9, 2010

Chadwick A. Jackson
Reg. No. 46,495

Hanify & King, Professional Corporation
Intellectual Property Law Department
1055 Thomas Jefferson St, N.W.
Suite 400
Washington, D.C. 20007
Direct: (202) 403-2102